



**SUMMARY OF ISSUES TO BE DISCUSSED AT
THE FIFTY-SEVENTH MEETING OF
THE CITES STANDING COMMITTEE**
GENEVA, SWITZERLAND • 14-18 JULY 2008

SC=Standing Committee • AC = Animals Committee • PC = Plants Committee • RC=Resolution Conf. • CoP=Conference of the Parties

ISSUE		PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
1. Opening Remarks by the Chairman No Document		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No document. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No comment.
2. Agenda SC57 Doc. 2		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provisional agenda for the meeting is presented for consideration and adoption. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No comment.
3. Working programme SC57 Doc. 3		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Working program for the meeting is presented for consideration and adoption. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No comment.
4. Rules of Procedure			
4.1	Recommendations of the Secretariat SC57 Doc. 4.1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides the SC Rules of Procedure (ROP) that were last amended at SC53. The Secretariat makes the following recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Credentials: the RoP are unclear on the consequences when a participant does not submit credentials; the SC may want to: take no action, indicate to whom credentials apply, indicate actions taken in response to a lack of credentials, and/or establish a Working Group. ■ Observers from international organizations: the RoP be amended to indicate that approval from the country in which the organization is located is only needed for national organizations. ■ Documents: Rule 20 of the RoP be amended as follows: <i><u>"The documents shall also be provided to all Parties that When the Secretariat believes that a Party may be directly affected by any discussion of the documents and to all Parties that request them a document to be considered by the Committee, it shall alert the Party concerned and inform it where the document may be viewed on the CITES website."</u></i> 	<p>Support in part / Oppose in part the following paragraphs of the proposed Rules of Procedure [deleted text strikethrough, new text underlined]:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Credentials: SSN agrees that the SC RoP should reflect the CoP RoP as far as possible including requiring credentials from representatives of States, and restricting voting to those members with appropriate credentials. SSN sees no value in requiring credentials from representatives of Observers. ● Observers from international organizations: SSN agrees with the Secretariat that the RoP should be amended to indicate that approval from the country in which the organization is located is only needed for national organizations. ● Documents: SSN recommends that the last sentence of Rule 20 of the SC RoP be amended to reflect the RoP recently adopted by the AC and PC: <i><u>"The documents shall also be provided to The Secretariat shall alert all Parties that may be directly affected by any discussion of the documents and provide copies to all Parties that request them."</u></i>

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
<p>4.2</p> <p>Submission of documents</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 4.2</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prepared by Israel. • Rule 19 of the SC RoP states that “documents to be considered at a meeting shall normally be provided to the Secretariat at least 60 days before the meeting where they are to be discussed,...” • Rule 20 of the SC RoP states in part, “All documents submitted to the Secretariat by a Party, or submitted by an observer at the request of the Chairman, shall be placed on the Secretariat’s website as soon as possible after they are received, in the original language in which they have been submitted.” • Notes that at SC54, 18 of 73 documents were submitted late and at SC55, 11 of 13 documents were submitted late. • Encourages the SC to address this problem of late submission of documents. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN notes that most documents that are not posted to the CITES website 60 days before the meeting are those prepared by the Secretariat. • SSN recommends the following changes to Rule 20 [new text <u>underlined</u>]: “All documents submitted to the Secretariat by a Party, <u>prepared by the Secretariat</u>, or submitted by an observer at the request of the Chairman, shall be placed on the Secretariat’s website as soon as possible after they are received, in the original language in which they have been submitted, <u>but not later than 5 working days after the submission deadline.</u>”
<p>5. Credentials</p> <p>No document</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No document. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No comment.
<p>6. Election of Vice-Chairman and Alternate Vice-Chairman</p> <p>No document</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No document. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No comment.
<p>7. Admission of observers</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 6</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No document. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No comment.
<p>8. Clearing House</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 8</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Invites the SC to appoint a new Member of the CITES Clearing House as Mr Colman O’Criadain is no longer an official of the Government of Ireland. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No comment.
<p>9. Strategic Vision 2008-2013: Development of indicators</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 9</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision 14.1 directs the SC to develop indicators for the objectives in RC 14.2 on <i>the CITES Strategic Vision: 2008-2013</i>. • Decision 14.2 directs the Secretariat to request Party input on the indicators developed by the Strategic Vision Working Group and to submit responses to SC57. • Contains the responses of the Parties to the Secretariat’s Notification 2008/009 of 5 February 2008. • The Secretariat recommends that the SC establish a Working Group consisting of the Parties having made written contributions, assisted by the Secretariat, to consolidate their 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>supports</u> the recommendation to establish a Working Group on indicators for the objectives of the Strategic Vision and <u>encourages</u> the SC to invite observer organizations that submitted written comments to join the Working Group. • SSN notes, however, that no responses were received from Africa or Asia and only one (Colombia) from LAC. These regions should nonetheless be represented in the Working Group if possible. • Please see SSN’s factsheet on this issue.

ISSUE		PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		submissions for adoption by the SC.	
10. Relationship with the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) SC57 Doc. 10		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No document available at the time this document was prepared. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No comment.
11. Cooperation with the Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals (CMS) SC57 Doc. 11		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> RC 13.3 on <i>Cooperation and synergy with the Convention on the Conservation of Migratory Species of Wild Animals (CMS)</i> directs the SC to keep the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with CMS. Invites the SC to endorse the draft list of CITES-CMS joint activities for 2008-2010 presented in Annex 2. Once a final list is agreed by both Conventions, both Secretariats will sign the new Annex to the MoU and proceed with its implementation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> SSN supports the proposed list of joint activities with the following changes [deleted text striketrough, new text <u>underlined</u>] to the text in the second column (2) under, "Joint actions for the conservation and sustainable use of shared species": "<i>Working with these stakeholders, develop joint programmes for the conservation <u>of these species</u> and/or to ensure <u>that any use of these species is sustainable use</u> of these species.</i>" One purpose of the CITES Strategic Vision is "<i>that international trade in wild fauna and flora is conducted at sustainable levels...</i>" (RC 14.2 on the CITES Strategic Vision: 2008-2013), not to ensure use.
12. Cooperation with the World Trade Organization (WTO) SC57 Doc. 12		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Secretariat recommends that the SC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> have the Chair request, again, observer status for CITES in the General Council and any other WTO bodies deemed relevant for CITES; identify the WTO bodies, other than the General Council and the Committee on Trade and Environment (including its Special Sessions), that it deems relevant to CITES; and The Secretariat also discusses the option of establishing an MOU with WTO, noting that doing so might not solve the observership issue. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> SSN <u>supports</u> the recommendation for CITES to request observer status at the WTO General Council and the Committee on Trade and Environment (including its Special Sessions). SSN believes that other WTO bodies are not relevant to CITES and therefore that no further identification process is necessary. SSN also believes that the areas of interest between WTO and CITES are not broad enough to make an MOU desirable or necessary.
13. Financial matters			
13.1	Report for 2007 SC57 Doc. 13.1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provides information on the expenditures of the Secretariat in 2007 (Annex 1), which totaled US\$5.08 million, along with the status of contributions from the Parties (Annexes 2, 3 and 4). Provides an overview of the availability of the CITES Trust Fund resources and their use in the biennium 2006-2007 (Annex 5). States that the balance of the CITES Trust Fund as of 31 December 2007 stood at US\$2,144,523 of which US\$700,000 represents the operating cash reserve to guarantee the liquidity of the Trust Fund. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regarding actual expenditures for 2007 by category of service (Annex I), SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to request greater detail in reporting, including an itemized accounting of expenditures. Currently, the categories are so general that it is impossible to evaluate the return for funds spent or to make suggestions on where costs can be reduced. Regarding unpaid contributions, SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC request the Secretariat to distribute a list of those Parties with unpaid contribution for more than one year at each meeting of the SC and that the SC decide on follow up actions needed.

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
<p>13.2</p> <p>Estimated expenditures for 2008</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 13.2</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> States that the total program resources for 2008 amount to US\$4,744,714 as approved by the CoP13 but that an additional amount of US\$314,717 is needed to cover the projected expenditure, which is proposed to be drawn down from the accumulated Trust Fund balance. Reports that the Secretariat continues to reduce its costs by promoting the use of the CITES website, among other efforts; documents previously sent by mail or faxed to the Parties are now made available through the website. Notes that the projected flow and use of resources of the CITES Trust Fund for 2008 leads to an estimated balance of US\$1.87 million at the end of the year, of which US\$ 0.7 million represents the operating cash reserve. Provides the estimated expenditures for 2008 (Annex 1) and a projection of flow and use of resources for 2008 (Annex 2). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regarding estimated expenditures for 2008, SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to request greater detail in reporting, including itemized costs of expenditures. Currently, the categories of service are so general that it is difficult to impossible to evaluate the return for funds spent or to make suggestions on where costs can be reduced. SSN <u>commends</u> the CITES Secretariat for reducing costs by promoting the use of the CITES website but urges the Secretariat to secure reliable methods of information sharing for developing countries that may not have Internet access. SSN provides recommendations on cost-saving measures under SC57 Doc. 13.3 below.
<p>13.3</p> <p>Costed programme of work (CPW) for 2009-2011</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 13.3</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> RC 14.1 on <i>Financing and the Costed Programme of Work (CPW) for the Secretariat for the triennium 2009-2011</i> states that the CPW should be covered by contributions from the Parties for the amounts of US\$4,904,991 for 2009, US\$ 5,426,937 for 2010 and US\$5,150,247 for 2011. These amounts represent a 6% increase over the budget for the triennium 2006-2008. Reports that a Finance and Budget Subcommittee for the consideration of all financial and budgetary matters has been established but that neither Africa nor South and Central America and the Caribbean have responded to requests to select one country from the region as member of the group. Requests SC57 to agree to the CPW for the CITES Secretariat for 2009-2011 (Annex 1) which is organized by goals and objectives of the CITES Strategic Vision. Also provides the Comparative budget between the triennium 2006-2008 and the triennium 2009-2011 (Annex 2) and an Organigramme of the CITES Secretariat 2009-2011 (Annex 3). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to ensure that essential expenditures, such as implementation and enforcement activities and the Review of Significant Trade, receive priority in terms of funding from the CITES Trust Fund. While the CPW is a helpful tool, SSN <u>suggests</u> that the SC request a more detailed budget under the categorizations used in Annex 2 (particularly for 'other activities') which would allow monitoring of budget and expenditures over time for particular programs identified in the CPW and assist the SC in establishing priorities for funding. SSN <u>recommends</u> that the following non-priority activities receive external funding only (no funds from the CITES Trust Fund): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 9. Secretariat's assessment of listing proposals (US\$210,083) 12. CMS activities (US\$298,391) 22. CITES Virtual College (US\$1,345,192) 36. Cooperation between biodiversity-related MEAs (US\$182,658) 39. Relationships with other institutions (US\$449,794) SSN <u>recommends</u> that the following items be deleted from the budget or, minimally, that they receive no funds from the CITES Trust Fund but are funded entirely by external funds: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 5. Review and operation of Scientific Authorities (US\$144,940) 7. Review of Resolutions (US\$182,447) 29. Cooperation with Breton Woods organizations (US\$43,021) 30. Raising public awareness (US\$653,832) 32. Wildlife trade policy reviews, Biotrade projects (US\$398,488) 33. Promotion within the private sector (US\$95,098)

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		<p>34. Indicators of sustainability (US\$71,152) 35. Benefits of wildlife trade (US\$158,021) Any items retained should be scrutinized to see if the amounts requested can be reduced.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC Chair to reconsider the decision that there will be no observers on the Finance and Budget Subcommittee. • SSN <u>commends</u> the CITES Secretariat for reducing costs in the proposed CPW but urges the Secretariat to secure reliable methods of information sharing for developing countries that may not have Internet access.
<p>14. CITES and livelihoods SC57 Doc. 14</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prepared by the Secretariat in consultation with Argentina, China, Nicaragua, and the UK. • Decision 14.3 directs the SC to initiate and supervise a process to develop, by CoP15: a) tools for voluntary use by the Parties for the rapid assessment at the national level of the positive and negative impacts of implementing CITES listing decisions on the livelihoods of the poor, in conformity with RC 8.3 (Rev. CoP13); and b) draft voluntary guidelines for Parties to address these impacts, particularly in developing countries. • Recommends that the SC create an intersessional Working Group on livelihoods and that the group prepare two papers: one to address possible tools for rapid assessment and a second to provide guidance on how to address the impacts, and to propose draft voluntary guidelines for the Parties. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to invite observer organizations to participate in the intersessional Working Group.
<p>15. Review of the scientific committees SC57 Doc. 15</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision 14.6 directs the SC, in cooperation with the AC, PC, and the Secretariat, to “<i>develop a costed proposal to assess the costs, advantages and disadvantages of the provision of a chairman [of the scientific committees] independent of regional duties and responsibilities, selected by the Conference of the Parties on a regional rotational basis</i>”. • Provides the observations of the Secretariat on the advantages and disadvantages and invites the SC to assess these, in order for the Secretariat to present cost estimates for any new arrangements at SC58. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>opposes</u> the suggestion that chairs of the scientific committees be independent of regional duties and responsibilities: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Members of the committees, including chairs, should be selected by the committee Members on the basis of their scientific expertise and chairmanship ability rather than a popular vote at a CoP, or on the need to select a chair from a particular region. ■ Though an ‘independent’ chair may be thought of as being free of regional obligations, the chair would still be influenced by the perspectives of his region, but would have less oversight and accountability for decision-making than a regional representative. ■ SSN strongly <u>believes</u> that committee members, including chairs, should receive backing by their governments. If the chairs have no representational capabilities, it can be expected that they would receive less support from their government, including financial support.

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
<p>16. Review of Resolutions</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 16</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision 14.19 directs the SC to “review any proposals from the Secretariat to correct nonsubstantive errors or minor editorial faults in current Resolutions and decide whether they should be referred to the Conference of the Parties. In cases where the Committee agrees with the proposals and considers that they need not be referred to the Conference, it may instruct the Secretariat to republish the Resolutions with the necessary corrections.” • The Secretariat recommends that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ the SC establish an intersessional Working Group to which the Secretariat should send its proposals; and ■ the Working Group review the proposals and present its recommendations to SC58. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to invite observer organizations to join the intersessional Working Group.
<p>17. National wildlife trade policy reviews</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 17</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides information on progress made in reviewing national wildlife trade policies, including implementation of Decisions 14.21 to 14.24 and invites the SC to note the report. • States that reports from the countries (Madagascar, Nicaragua, Uganda and Vietnam) participating in the review are expected to be available by the end of May 2008. • Requests regional representatives to the SC to advise the Secretariat of any Party in their region that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ may have undertaken a national wildlife trade policy review and might share the lessons learned; ■ may be interested in carrying out such a review; or ■ may be interested in providing financial or technical support for these reviews. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC establish an intersessional Working Group to provide greater input into the review and the reports. • SSN <u>recommends</u> that observers be invited to participate in the Working Group.
<p>18. National laws for implementation of the Convention</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 18</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision 14.25 directs Parties and dependent territories with CITES legislation in Category 2 or 3 for five or more years to enact CITES legislation or provide an adequate justification for not doing so before SC58. • Decision 14.26 directs the SC to consider appropriate compliance measures with respect to Parties that do not comply with Decision 14.25, including recommendations to suspend trade in specimens of CITES-listed species to and from such Parties. • The Secretariat recommends that the SC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ identify Bolivia, El Salvador and Tanzania as countries requiring attention as a priority under the National Legislation Project; ■ issue a written caution to Mozambique, South Africa and Venezuela advising them of the need to accelerate their 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ adopt the recommendations of the Secretariat; ■ maintain the current suspensions until adequate legislation is enacted; ■ request the Secretariat to explain why Ecuador is not recommended for identification as a priority country, and why Bolivia, El Salvador and Tanzania were not identified before now; ■ request the Secretariat to provide at SC58, a timeline of communications/actions taken in regard to each of the priority countries under the National Legislation Project, in order to gauge the countries’ responsiveness to the need for adequate CITES legislation; and ■ provide more detail on Paraguay’s progress towards adopting national CITES legislation. The Secretariat reports that, “...Paraguay and the Secretariat should implement in a gradual

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
	<p>efforts to enact adequate legislation by SC58; and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ remind Parties and dependent territories affected by Decision 14.25 that SC58 will determine whether they have submitted to the Secretariat newly enacted legislation by that time or have provided adequate justification for their failure to do so. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Notes that the addition of the above countries would result in a total list of 22 priority countries under the National Legislation Project (Algeria, Bolivia, the Comoros, Djibouti*, El Salvador, Tanzania, Belize, Guinea Bissau*, Kazakhstan, Kenya, Liberia*, Malaysia, Mauritania*, Mozambique, Nigeria*, Pakistan, Paraguay, Peru, Rwanda*, Somalia*, South Africa, Venezuela). <p><i>*currently subject to a CITES trade suspension</i></p>	<p><i>manner a series of cooperative actions aimed at ensuring that the requisite conditions are in place for lifting the [trade] moratorium” but makes no mention of Paraguay’s legislative progress.</i></p>
<p>19. Cooperation between Parties and promotion of multilateral measures</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 19</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Decision 14.30 states that the Secretariat shall, if funds are available, hire a consultant to prepare a report on ways to assess whether: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ the CITES Resolutions are implemented by all Parties as consistently as possible and whether there is a need to clarify, revise or repeal them; and ■ the scope for multilateral CITES processes that reduce the need by Parties for recourse to stricter domestic measures and reservations should be further developed. ● Decision 14.29 directs SC57 to establish an intersessional Working Group to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ review the report; ■ organize a meeting to discuss the report; and ■ consider the need to draft any revised or new resolutions for CoP15. ● The Secretariat invites the SC to establish an intersessional Working Group on multilateral measures. ● The Secretariat suggests that the Working Group may wish to seek from Parties information on the experience they gained by reviewing their stricter domestic measures and reservations as described in Decision 14.28. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to invite observer organizations to join the intersessional Working Group. ● SSN <u>notes</u> that stricter domestic measures are a sovereign right of the Parties, and may be enacted by exporting countries that do not wish to trade in their native species regardless of CITES procedures. Importing Parties often enact stricter domestic measures in response to ineffective CITES implementation and enforcement or in response to factors outside the control of CITES (such as disease or invasive species issues). When CITES Resolutions are not implemented, the fault often lies with a lack of available resources rather than the need to revise or repeal a Resolution. SSN <u>believes</u> that providing greater support to Parties for implementation and enforcement of the CITES Resolutions would be a more productive and effective use of funds than the proposed analysis.
<p>20. Enforcement matters</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 20</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Requests the SC to endorse the recommendations in the report (contained in the Annex) of a November 2007 mission to Egypt to examine implementation of CITES, noting the concerns expressed about illegal trade involving great apes and ivory. ● Reminds Parties that Alerts are no longer distributed by mail 	<p><u>Regarding the report on the mission to Egypt:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SSN <u>notes</u> that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Exports of Egyptian species listed in Appendix I or II or, imports of Appendix I specimens, should not take place until Egypt’s Scientific Authority has the capacity to issue science-based non-detriment findings;

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
	<p>but are posted on the Enforcement Authorities Forum on the CITES website.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Suggests that the SC should request regional representatives to report on designation of enforcement authorities by Parties in their region at SC58. ● Describes concerns when one country does not act on intelligence regarding illegal trade received from a second country. ● Describes enforcement-related activities led by the Secretariat who attended meetings of the World Customs Organizations, the South Asia Wildlife Trade Initiative and a U.S.A. congressional hearing. ● Mentions that a report from Nigeria on their progress with the enforcement of the Convention is expected at this meeting (Nigeria is currently the only CITES Party subject to a trade suspension because of enforcement issues). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Egypt has been a destination for illegal trade in primates for many years (SC54 Doc. 38); ■ confiscations and seizures of illegally traded specimens are rare and the means of disposal are likely to reward involvement; and ■ the report is only available in English, which is likely to interfere with proper access to information by non-English speakers on the SC. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to require, in addition to fulfillment of the report's recommendations, that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ enforcement officers (Customs, police) are stationed at ports and borders and are empowered and trained to enforce CITES; ■ suitable penalties for wildlife crimes are established and applied; ■ enforcement personnel receive the necessary support from the judiciary and that case results, including penalties applied, are publicly available; ■ the CITES Scientific Authority is provided the necessary resources and training to make science-based non-detriment findings; ■ national regulations (not simply guidelines) for the confiscation and placement of live wildlife are developed and publicly available; ■ Egypt report on the results of its review of the implementation of the Convention as requested at SC54; and ■ confiscated great apes (chimpanzees & gorillas) currently in custody be DNA tested to ascertain their country and region of origin to help initiate proper enforcement (PASA, a member of SSN is volunteering to cooperate with Egypt by funding the testing). ● SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to require Egypt to report on its progress to SC58 and establish a deadline of CITES CoP15 for fulfillment of the recommendations. ● SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC establish a trade suspension with Egypt until the recommendations are fulfilled. <p><u>Regarding other enforcement matters</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SSN <u>notes</u> with concern that the exclusive distribution of Alerts through posting on the Enforcement Authorities Forum of the CITES website is likely to exclude countries from the developing world that have difficulties accessing the Internet or that do not have easy access to computers. SSN <u>encourages</u> the CITES Secretariat to adapt its communication methods to the needs of developing countries that are Parties to CITES and to give these countries the choice to continue receiving Alerts by mail.

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
<p>21. National reports</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 21</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports that Djibouti, Dominica and Rwanda have failed to provide annual reports for four consecutive years. • Reports that Belize, the Central African Republic, Guinea, Kazakhstan, Lesotho, Nepal, the Syrian Arab Republic and Vanuatu have failed to provide annual reports for three consecutive years. • States that CITES Parties should soon be able to test the English version of the online biennial report format. • Decision 14.37 directs the SC to undertake a review of the recommendations to Parties to provide special reports under the Convention, assess whether they have been or might be effectively incorporated into the annual and biennial reports, and report to CoP15 on this issue. In response, the Secretariat recommends that the SC establish an intersessional Working Group on Special Reporting Requirements. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>supports</u> the suggestion that regional representatives be asked to report on designation of enforcement authorities at SC58. • SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC suspend trade with Djibouti, Dominica and Rwanda as the Secretariat reports that they have failed to provide annual reports for four consecutive years. • SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC suspend trade with Belize, the Central African Republic, Guinea, Kazakhstan, Lesotho, Nepal, the Syrian Arab Republic and Vanuatu for not having submitted annual reports for three consecutive years. RC 11.17 (Rev. CoP14) <i>on National Reports</i> recommends that Parties not authorize trade in specimens of CITES-listed species with any Party that the SC has determined has failed, for three consecutive years, to provide annual reports. • SSN <u>supports</u> the recommendation that the SC establish a Working Group on Special Reporting Requirements and we encourage the SC to invite observer organizations to join the group.
<p>22. Ranching operations</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 22</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The population of the Nile crocodile (<i>Crocodylus niloticus</i>) from Madagascar is included in Appendix II under RC 11.16 (Rev. CoP14) <i>on Ranching and trade in ranched specimens of species transferred from Appendix I to Appendix II</i>. • In response to concerns about possibly laundering of wild specimens, the Secretariat undertook a mission to Madagascar in 2006. • In January 2008, Madagascar was advised by the SC to, <i>inter alia</i>, implement the Strategy and Management Plan for Crocodiles in Madagascar, comply with RC 11.16 (Rev. CoP14), and report to SC57. • Madagascar's work plan is provided in the Annex but no report was received for SC57. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to set a deadline of SC58 for Madagascar to enact the recommendations. If compliance is not forthcoming, the SC should consider a trade suspension.
<p>23. Introduction from the sea</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 23</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision 14.48 directs SC57 to establish an intersessional Working Group on Introduction from the Sea in order to consider a definition for 'transportation into a State', clarification of 'State of introduction' as well as other issues. • Invites the SC to establish the group and suggests that available members of the group may wish to convene on the margins of SC57 to begin work. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to invite observer organizations to join the intersessional Working Group.

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
<p>24. Purpose codes on CITES permits and certificates</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 24</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Decision 14.54 directs the SC to establish an intersessional Working Group to review the use of purpose-of-transaction codes by Parties, provides Terms of Reference for the group, and directs the group to submit any recommendations for amendments to RC 12.3 (Rev. CoP14) on <i>Permits and certificates</i> to SC58. Invites the SC to establish the Working Group at the present meeting. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to invite observer organizations to join the intersessional Working Group.
<p>25. Electronic permitting</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 25</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Decision 14.55 directs the SC to extend the mandate of the Working Group on Information Technologies and Electronic Systems in order to develop the use of electronic permitting systems among Parties. An oral report will be provided to SC57. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> SSN <u>urges</u> the SC and the Working Group on Information Technologies and Electronic Systems to secure reliable methods of reporting and information sharing for developing countries that may not have Internet access.
<p>26. Trade in crocodylian specimens</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 26</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Decision 14.62 directs the SC to establish a Working Group on Trade in Crocodylian Specimens to review the implementation and effectiveness of the universal tagging system and the trade in small crocodylian leather goods. Invites the SC to establish the group that includes, <i>inter alia</i>, the representative selected by AC23 (Dietrich Jelden of Germany) and to designate a chair. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> SSN <u>supports</u> the recommendation to invite observer organizations to join the intersessional Working Group.
<p>27. Identification manual</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 27</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reports that the database of published sheets of the Identification Manual is now on-line. Proposes to transfer the Identification Manual to a 'Wiki' format that on-line allows users to create, edit and link Web pages; a demonstration will be provided at SC57. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> While SSN <u>supports</u> the conversion of the Identification Manual to a 'Wiki' format, we <u>urge</u> the SC to secure reliable methods of access for developing countries that may not have Internet access.
<p>28. Personal and household effects</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 28</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Prepared by the Secretariat, in consultation with the Chairman of the Working Group on Personal and Household Effects. Decision 14.64 directs the SC to extend the operation of its Working Group on Personal and Household Effects and provides Terms of Reference for the group, including, <i>inter alia</i>, to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> clarify the relationship between 'tourist souvenirs' and 'personal and household effects'; assess whether there are specific species or types of personal or household effects which would require different treatment under RC 13.7 (Rev. CoP14); assess whether there is a need to amend the Resolution; and report at each regular meeting of the SC until CoP15 and 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No comment.

ISSUE		PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		<p>at CoP15.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports that the Working Group has begun discussing how to fulfill its terms of reference via e-mail and will report to SC58. 	
29. Review of Significant Trade			
29.1	<p>Implementation of recommendations of the Animals and Plants Committees</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 29.1 (Rev. 2)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides background information on plant and animals species subject to the Review of Significant Trade since CoP11, recommendations made by the scientific committees for these species, and recommendations for further action by the SC. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Aloe spp.</u>: SSN <u>agrees</u> that Kenya has complied with the recommendations and that the species should be removed from the Review. • <u>Prunus africana (red stinkwood)</u>: SSN <u>agrees</u> with the recommended actions for Burundi, Kenya, and Madagascar, namely that if they seek to recommence exports, they must supply information on how the PC recommendations have been implemented. SSN also <u>agrees</u> that the deadline for Cameroon, the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC), Equatorial Guinea, and Tanzania should be extended to 31 December 2008, considering a <i>P. africanus</i> workshop will be held in September. We <u>encourage</u> the SC to specifically address concerns regarding illegal exports from DRC and to request the PC to report on any trade shifts by exporting countries in response to the Review. • <u>Cibotium barometz</u>: SSN <u>agrees</u> with the recommendation to extend the compliance deadline to 31 March 2009 but also <u>urges</u> the SC to require that Vietnam immediately adopt a cautious export quota for the species until more information is forthcoming. • <u>Cyathea contaminans</u>: SSN <u>agrees</u> with the recommendation to extend the compliance deadline to 31 March 2009 but also <u>urges</u> the SC to require that Indonesia immediately adopt a cautious export quota for the species until more information is forthcoming. • <u>Dendrobium nobile</u>: SSN <u>agrees</u> with the recommendation to suspend trade in the species until Lao has shown compliance with Article IV. Regarding Vietnam, SSN <u>agrees</u> with the recommendation to extend the compliance deadline until 31 March 2009 but also <u>urges</u> the SC to consult with the PC to ensure that the export quota adopted for the species is sufficiently cautious until more information is forthcoming. • <u>Galanthus woronowii (snowdrop)</u>: SSN <u>agrees</u> with the recommendation to extend the compliance deadline for Georgia to 18 August 2008 and to maintain the 2006 export quota. SSN is pleased that the Secretariat consulted with the PC on this matter. • <u>Falco cherrug (saker falcon)</u>: Considering that Mongolia was

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		<p>recommended to immediately suspend exports in September 2005, that exports of wild specimens continue, and that information provided by Mongolia on the status of the species is incomplete, SSN <u>urges</u> the SC not to extend the implementation deadline and to agree to a trade suspension at SC57.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>Psittacus erithacus (African grey parrot)</u>: SSN is <u>concerned</u> that in response to non-compliance for avian species, the Secretariat has recommended zero quotas in its list of annual export quotas rather than trade suspensions. Regarding Cameroon, Congo, Côte d'Ivoire, Equatorial Guinea, Guinea, Liberia, and Sierra Leone, SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to adopt trade suspensions for these countries as all have failed to respond to the recommendations. SSN <u>commends</u> the DRC for adopting the reduced quota. • <u>Poicephalus senegalus (Senegal parrot)</u>: SSN is concerned that in response to non-compliance for avian species, the Secretariat has recommended zero quotas in its list of annual export quotas rather than trade suspensions. SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to adopt a trade suspension for exports for Guinea and Liberia as they have failed to respond to the recommendations. Regarding Mali, SSN <u>agrees</u> that the Secretariat should obtain a copy of the study but that Mali should be required to respond no later than a deadline of 31 December 2008 (not, as the Secretariat suggests, by SC58). SSN also <u>urges</u> the SC to require Mali to immediately establish a cautious export quota because Mali's proposed quota of 19,000 specimens is not cautious as there have been no population surveys of the species and is the same quota used by Mali prior to the Review. • <u>Gracula religiosa (hill myna)</u>: SSN <u>agrees</u> with the recommendation that Malaysia's zero export quota be maintained until the recommendations are complied with. • <u>Phelsuma v-nigra (Grand Comoro day gecko) and Phelsuma comorensis (Comoros day gecko)</u>: SSN <u>agrees</u> that the SC should suspend trade in the species from Comoros until the recommendations have been complied with. • <u>Uromastyx dispar (Sudan uromastyx)</u>: SSN <u>agrees</u> that the SC should suspend trade in the species from Mali until the recommendations have been complied with. • <u>Uromastyx geyri (Saharan spiny-tailed lizard)</u>: Regarding Mali, SSN is concerned that Mali failed to respond as to the required information on the scientific basis of its non-detriment finding but

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		<p>instead lowered its quota. SSN disagrees with the recommendation that Mali simply maintain this quota. SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to extend the deadline for compliance to 31 December 2008 and to recommend a trade suspension should Mali fail to report measures used to make a science-based non-detriment finding at that time. Regarding Niger, SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to request that Niger maintain its zero export quota until the recommendations of the AC are complied with.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tridacnidae (giant clams): Regarding Madagascar, the Federated States of Micronesia, Marshall Islands, Palau, Papua New Guinea, Tonga, Vanuatu, Vietnam, SSN <u>agrees</u> with the recommendations to suspend trade of these species from both Parties and non-Parties for their lack of response. SSN <u>agrees</u> that Fiji, France, Mozambique, have complied with the recommendations and should be removed from the Review. • Country-based Review of Significant Trade (Madagascar): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ SSN <u>notes</u> that the AC and PC have agreed that the country-based Review of Significant Trade in Madagascar has now been completed. ■ SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to direct the AC and PC not to undertake additional country-based reviews until the results of the Evaluation of the Review of Significant Trade are available.
<p>29.2</p>	<p>Review of recommendations to suspend trade made more than two years ago</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 29.2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • RC 12.8 (Rev. CoP13) on <i>Review of Significant Trade in specimens of Appendix-II species</i> states that the SC, in consultation with the Secretariat and the Chair of the AC or PC, shall review recommendations to suspend trade that have been in place for longer than two years and, if appropriate, take measures to address the situation. • Provides a list of suspensions established prior to September 2003, the recommendations of the Secretariat (Annex 1), and an analysis by TRAFFIC (Annex 2). • Requests the SC to note changes in nomenclature for some of these species adopted at CITES CoP14. • Provides a letter and report from Tanzania requesting the withdrawal of the recommendation to suspend trade in <i>Agapornis fischeri</i> (Fischer's lovebird) (Annex 3). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>agrees</u> that the SC should note the changes in nomenclature adopted at CITES CoP14. • SSN <u>reminds</u> the SC that paragraph (u) of RC 12.8 (Rev. CoP13) states, "<i>a recommendation to suspend trade in the affected species with the State concerned should be withdrawn only (emphasis added) when that State demonstrates to the satisfaction of the Standing Committee, through the Secretariat, compliance with Article IV, paragraph 2 (a), 3 or 6 (a).</i>" SSN is concerned that the Secretariat, for several species, recommends removal of trade suspensions though Article IV has not been complied with. • SSN <u>notes</u> that the TRAFFIC report contains a number of recommendations to the AC. SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to direct AC24 to consider these issues before taking any decisions. • Argentina- <i>Lama glama guanicoe</i> (guanaco): SSN <u>agrees</u> with the recommendation to remove the suspension because a regulation has been adopted at the national level to limit exports to wool sheared from live animals. Such wool is exempt from the suspension.

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <p>Democratic Republic of the Congo - <u>Stigmochelys pardalis</u> (leopard tortoise): SSN <u>disagrees</u> with the recommendation to withdraw the suspension if DRC confirms to the Secretariat that it will not issue export permits for this species until it has established a process for making non-detriment findings. RC 12.8 (Rev. CoP13) clearly states that the suspension should remain in place until DRC has complied with Article IV. The TRAFFIC report indicates that DRC is waiting to receive information on the species from scientific institutions in the country. Also, there are doubts that this arid-land species actually occurs in the country. SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to maintain the suspension; the Secretariat should re-examine the suspension once the scientific information has been provided. For additional information, see the text under ‘Tanzania’ in this column. <u>Hippopotamus amphibius</u> (hippopotamus): SSN <u>agrees</u> that the suspension should be withdrawn if DRC provides documentation that the Ministerial decree providing fully protected status for this species has been signed and, given that numbers of this species have declined by 95% in the DRC since 1994 due to unregulated hunting, if DRC demonstrates it will effectively address poaching and illegal trade. <u>Poicephalus robustus</u> (brown-headed parrot): SSN <u>disagrees</u> with the recommendation to withdraw the suspension if DRC establishes a “cautious” export quota for the species. RC 12.8 (Rev. CoP13) clearly states that the suspension should remain in place until DRC has complied with Article IV. DRC has failed to respond to the recommendations and should not have the suspension lifted in response. SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to maintain the suspension; the suspension should be re-examined only if DRC can provide science-based information on the size of the population and status of the species in the country.</p> <p>Lithuania - <u>Lynx lynx</u> (Eurasian lynx): SSN <u>agrees</u> that the suspension should be withdrawn as Lithuania has a ban on export and hunting of the species.</p> <p>Madagascar – <u>Chamaeleo spp.</u> (chameleons) and <u>Phelsuma spp.</u> (day geckos): SSN <u>disagrees</u> that the SC should request the AC to re-evaluate its recommendations concerning the export of <i>Chamaeleo</i> spp. and <i>Phelsuma</i> spp. on a species by species basis. SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to maintain the suspension because the recommendations made for the genus, such as providing the biological basis for non-detriment findings and undertaking scientifically based field assessments, also apply to the species level, and have not been forthcoming from Madagascar. It should</p>

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		<p>be noted that population estimates quoted in the TRAFFIC study for some chameleon species are not the result of field sightings but have been calculated on the basis of theoretically “suitable” habitat data that are more than 20 years old. No quantitative population density estimates for <i>Chamaeleo</i> spp. or <i>Phelsuma</i> spp. are known to have been made. Also, according to UNEP/WCMC trade data, exports have not ceased despite the recommended trade suspension and demand in the international pet trade is high. Moreover, exports partly continue to be reported at genus rather than species level, rendering export suspensions or zero quotas for certain species ineffective. The fact that Madagascar has established an Action Plan under the country-based Review of Significant Trade should not prevent the SC from requiring that recommendations made for the genus or species level be implemented. Also, as noted in the TRAFFIC study (Annex 3) implementation of the Action Plan to date has been limited. <i>Coracopsis vasa</i> (greater vasa parrot): SSN <u>disagrees</u> with the recommendation to withdraw the suspension if Madagascar establishes a “cautious” export quota for the species. RC 12.8 (Rev. CoP13) clearly states that the suspension should remain in place <i>until</i> Madagascar has complied with Article IV. No population surveys have taken place since 1993. SSN urges the SC to maintain the suspension; the suspension should be re-examined if Madagascar can provide recent assessments of the size and status of the population in the country.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Malawi - <i>Hippopotamus amphibious</i> (hippopotamus): SSN <u>agrees</u> that the suspension should remain in place until Malawi provides information on implementation of Article IV. • Mali - <i>Poicephalus robustus</i> (brown-headed parrot): SSN <u>agrees</u> that the suspension should remain in place until Mali provides information on implementation of Article IV, including information that a viable resident population of the species exists in the country. • Moldova - <i>Lynx lynx</i> (Eurasian lynx): SSN <u>agrees</u> that the suspension should be withdrawn as there is no record of the species occurring in the country. • Mozambique - <i>Cordylus tropidosternum</i> (girdle-tailed lizard): SSN <u>agrees</u> that the suspension should remain in place until Malawi provides information on implementation of Article IV. • Nicaragua - <i>Dendrobates auratus</i> (green poison dart frog) and <i>D. pumilio</i> (strawberry poison dart frog): SSN <u>agrees</u> that the

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		<p>suspension should be withdrawn if Nicaragua provides evidence that exports are only of captive-bred specimens and that these comply with RC 10.16 (Rev.) on <i>Specimens of animal species bred in captivity</i>.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Peru - <i>Aratinga erythrogenys</i> (red-masked conure): SSN <u>agrees</u> that the suspension should be withdrawn if Peru confirms that export of wild-caught specimens is prohibited and if Peru effectively addresses the continuing export of wild specimens for commercial purposes despite its protected status. ● Rwanda - <i>Hippopotamus amphibious</i> (hippopotamus): Given that populations are small and declining in the country, SSN <u>disagrees</u> that the suspension should be withdrawn unless Rwanda can provide information on implementation of Article IV in the country or confirm that exports are prohibited. ● Solomon Islands - <i>Corucia zebrata</i> (Solomon Island skink), <i>Ornithoptera urvillianus</i> (D'Urville's birdwing), and <i>Ornithoptera victoriae</i> (Queen Victoria's birdwing): SSN <u>agrees</u> that the suspensions for these species should remain in place until Solomon Islands provides information on implementation of Article IV. ● Suriname - <i>Dendrobates tinctorius</i> (dyeing poison dart frog): SSN <u>disagrees</u> that the suspension should be withdrawn. Suriname established an annual export quota of 1,886 specimens in recent years and the quota was published by the Secretariat despite the suspension. SSN urges the SC to maintain the suspension for wild-caught specimens only until Suriname provides information on implementation of Article IV, including the results of field assessments of the species. ● Togo - <i>Poicephalus robustus</i> (brown-headed parrot): Noting that occurrence of the species in the country is in doubt, SSN <u>agrees</u> that the suspension must be maintained until Togo provides information on implementation of Article IV or prohibits exports. ● Ukraine - <i>Lynx lynx</i> (Eurasian lynx): SSN <u>agrees</u> that the suspension should be withdrawn as the species is protected in Ukraine. ● Tanzania - <i>Agapornis fischeri</i> (Fischer's lovebird): SSN <u>disagrees</u> with the recommendation to withdraw the trade suspension. The population study provided by Tanzania is insufficient to use as the basis to establish export quotas: the area surveyed totaled less than 3 km² and no information is provided to

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		<p>indicate the extent which the habitats surveyed are represented in the range of the species. The Secretariat cites claims that the species has become an agricultural pest but these statements are based on local perceptions and not on sound science. Local communities do report that, both before and after the trade ban, bird-scaring deterrents, and not trapping, is the main and most cost-effective method of control. SSN also is <u>concerned</u> that despite the suspension, the Secretariat has published an export quota for the species of 10,000 specimens for 2007 and 2008. SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC should maintain the suspension until Tanzania can provide sound population size estimates as the AC has recommended. <u>Stigmochelys pardalis (leopard tortoise), Gongylophis colubrinus (East African sand boa), Malacochersus tornieri (pancake tortoise), Poicephalus cryptoxanthus (brown-headed parrot), Poicephalus meyeri (Meyer's parrot), Poicephalus rufiventris (red-bellied parrot), Tauraco fischeri (Fischer's turaco)</u>: SSN disagrees with the recommendations to withdraw the suspensions for these species if Tanzania confirms that it will maintain export moratoria on wild-caught specimens until it has established a process for making non-detriment findings to the satisfaction of the Secretariat and Chairman of the AC. SSN strongly objects to the Secretariat 'reworking' the original recommendations of the scientific committees and, in the process, side-stepping the requirement for the Party involved to demonstrate implementation of Article IV (paragraph (u) of RC 12.8 (Rev. CoP13)) before a trade suspension is lifted. Such actions would invalidate the original recommendations of the AC and also eliminate the possibility of the AC to reinsert these species in the Review—leaving the species in a 'gray area' outside the scope of the Review. We encourage the SC to either: 1) eliminate these species from the Review if the trade moratoria are confirmed with the possibility to reinsert the species in the Review if trade is re-established, or 2) recognizing that Tanzania intends to re-establish trade, maintain the suspensions concerning wild-caught specimens until Tanzania provides information to demonstrate compliance with Article IV as required by RC 12.8 (Rev. CoP13).</p>
<p>30. Great apes SC57 Doc. 30</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● RC 13.4 on <i>Conservation of and trade in great apes</i> directs: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ the Secretariat, the SC, and AC to work with GRASP to contribute to the conservation of great apes and to the promotion of public awareness of the threat posed by illegal trade in these species, and 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SSN <u>commends</u> Indonesia for its enforcement efforts related to orangutans. ● Regarding the mission report on Malaysia, SSN <u>commends</u> Malaysia for its enforcement efforts related to orangutans. However, regarding the fact that most remaining orangutans live

ISSUE		PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ the SC to “review the implementation of this Resolution at each of its regular meetings on the basis of the Secretariat’s reports.” • Reports on work of the CITES Great Ape Enforcement Task Force, and on a regional Agreement on the Conservation of Gorillas and Their Habitats, negotiated under the CMS. • The annexes contain a report from Indonesia describing its enforcement work in relation to orangutans and a report from a technical mission to Malaysia to examine the illicit trade in orangutans. • The Secretariat suggests that the SC consider whether RC 13.4 should be amended at CoP15 to delete the requirement for a regular review by the SC. 	<p>outside protected areas, the SC should work with GRASP to encourage Malaysia to ensure that any expansion of plantations should be only allowed if there is no negative impact on orangutan habitat. In addition, SSN encourages the SC to work with GRASP to inquire about anecdotal reports that released specimens in one orangutan sanctuary in Malaysia are experiencing mortality rates of up to 70% due to close contact with tourists.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to retain the requirement in RC 13.4 for regular review by the SC. The situation for great apes in many range States remains dire. There is still need to review implementation of conservation and enforcement efforts for great apes, including capacity building, creation of public awareness, and problems of illegal trade and for the SC to ensure that progress is being made.
31. Asian big cats			
31.1	<p>Report of the Secretariat / Reports of various countries</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 31.1</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recalls the Decisions on Asian big cats adopted at CoP14 and reports on the Secretariat’s activities or recommendations regarding each Decision. • Directed to Parties: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ 14.65: <i>Asian big cat range States shall strengthen their efforts to implement Resolution Conf. 12.5 and, for tiger range States, report on progress at the 57th meeting of the Standing Committee, and subsequent meetings of the Standing Committee, and at the 15th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP15), with a review for CoP15 identifying gaps and additional measures needed.</i> The Secretariat reports that five tiger range States responded to CITES Notification to the Parties No. 2008/003 by submitting reports for SC57 (reports included in the Annexes to this document). ■ 14.66: <i>All Parties, especially those evaluating their domestic tiger trade control policies, shall take into consideration the view of the Parties as expressed in Resolution Conf. 12.5.</i> The Secretariat suggests that the SC consider how it wishes to monitor implementation of this Decision. ■ 14.67: <i>Asian big cat range States shall improve international cooperation in conservation and trade control through continual dialogue, and when convened, tiger range States are invited to participate in the tiger trade enforcement workshop and the conservation strategy workshop.</i> The 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision 14.65: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ SSN <u>commends</u> the Parties that submitted reports in response to Notification No. 2008/003, but is concerned that less than 50 percent of tiger range States submitted reports. ■ SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ agree to a standardized reporting format for submission of information to the SC in compliance with Decision 14.65 so as to ensure that all elements of RC 12.5 and the CoP14 Decisions are addressed in the reports, including identification of gaps and additional measures needed in accordance with Decision 14.65, and that benchmarks are established so that progress can be measured over time; ▪ request the Secretariat to send a Notification to the Parties including this new standardized reporting format and requesting Parties to submit reports, or revised reports in the case of those Parties that submitted reports for SC57, by no later than 1 October 2008, so that they can be considered at the upcoming tiger trade enforcement meeting, conservation strategy workshop, and the meeting of the CITES Tiger Enforcement Task Force / CITES Enforcement Expert Group; and ▪ request that the Secretariat send out another Notification to the Parties in early 2009 requesting Parties to submit updated reports for consideration at SC58; ▪ request SC Regional Representatives to assist Parties to comply with reporting requests; and ▪ at SC58, consider the reports received and additional information and prepare conclusions about gaps and additional

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
	<p>Secretariat had no comment on the implementation of this Decision.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ 14.68: <i>Parties are strongly encouraged to develop or improve implementation of regional enforcement networks.</i> The Secretariat notes that most range states, with the exception of the Russian Federation, are members of Asian regional enforcement networks (such as ASEAN Wildlife Enforcement Network). ■ 14.69: <i>Parties with intensive operations breeding tigers on a commercial scale shall implement measures to restrict the captive population to a level supportive only to conserving wild tigers; tigers should not be bred for trade in their parts and derivatives.</i> The Secretariat suggests that the SC consider how it wishes to monitor implementation of this Decision. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Directed to the Secretariat: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ 14.70: <i>Contingent upon availability of external funding, the Secretariat shall: convene a tiger trade enforcement meeting within 12 months of the end of CoP14; and cooperate in the development of a conservation strategy workshop, to be facilitated by IUCN – The World Conservation Union and the Global Tiger Forum (building on recent scientific work, including the 2006 Tiger Conservation Landscape Assessment) and other relevant organizations.</i> Regarding the enforcement meeting, the Secretariat reports that it has received the necessary pledges, hopes to hold the meeting in late 2008 or early 2009, believes it should focus on intelligence issues, and has sought Interpol’s assistance. Regarding the conservation strategy workshop, the Secretariat will meet at SC57 with IUCN and the Global Tiger Forum to determine a way forward. ■ 14.71: <i>The CITES Secretariat, in consultation with Parties that have or seek to have specialized wildlife crime units, shall provide technical assistance and assist with the identification of additional opportunities for technical and financial support.</i> The Secretariat notes that it will respond to requests for assistance and recalls that Annex 3 of Notification to the Parties 2001/047 contains guidance for specialized wildlife enforcement units prepared by the CITES Tiger Enforcement Task Force. ■ 14.72: <i>The CITES Tiger Enforcement Task Force shall, in conjunction with the CITES Enforcement Expert Group and in consultation with tiger range States, establish a mechanism</i> 	<p>measures needed and make recommendations to CoP15 in this regard.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Regarding the report from India (Annex 1), SSN <u>congratulates</u> India for its new efforts including increased ground presence of anti-poaching personnel in tiger reserves, the establishment of the Wildlife Crime Control Bureau, and on recovery of tiger populations where protection has been prioritized (i.e. Ranthambore Tiger Reserve). ■ Regarding the report from Malaysia (Annex 2), SSN <u>congratulates</u> Malaysia on its new CITES implementation law, its enforcement activities regarding TCM shops, and the success of the MYCAT campaign. ■ Regarding the report from Thailand (Annex 3), SSN <u>congratulates</u> Thailand for its cross-border workshop with Laos and enhanced public education activities. ■ Regarding the report from Vietnam (Annex 4), SSN <u>congratulates</u> Vietnam on enforcement actions to halt illegal tiger keeping and breeding; recommends that the SC consider how to assist Vietnam in locating funds to implement its Tiger Action Plan; and encourages Vietnam to continue its efforts to comply with RC 12.5. ■ Regarding the report from Indonesia (Annex 5), SSN <u>congratulates</u> Indonesia for its efforts in the Kerinci-Seblat National Park area, the Bukit Barisan Selatan National Park area, and public awareness and law enforcement activities. ■ Regarding the report from China (Annex 6), SSN <u>congratulates</u> China for its many efforts to stop tiger trade and educate the public, including the successful 1993 law that bans the trade in tiger bone and removing internet advertisements offering tiger parts and products. However, SSN remains <u>concerned</u> about the lack of pro-active enforcement efforts, as well as the confusion created by the issuance of permits for intensive operations breeding tigers on a commercial scale and for not stopping the sale of tiger bone wine at these operations. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision 14.66: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ request the Secretariat to send a Notification to the Parties in early 2009 requesting Parties to report to SC58 on how and whether they have taken into consideration the views of the Parties as expressed in RC 12.5, especially when evaluating their domestic tiger trade control policies; and ▪ at SC58, consider the reports received and additional

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
	<p><i>to regularly monitor and evaluate the scale and nature of illegal trade in Asian big cats.</i> The Secretariat reports that a meeting of the Expert Group will occur in the first half of 2009 and recommends that Task Force members attend this meeting where this matter should be discussed.</p>	<p>information and prepare conclusions about gaps and additional measures needed and make recommendations to CoP15 in this regard.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision 14.67: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC include this issue (how Asian big cat range States have improved international cooperation in conservation and trade control) in the standardized reporting format for determining compliance with Decision 14.65, as recommended above. • Decision 14.68: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC request the Secretariat to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ liaise with regional enforcement networks to determine how CITES can help them to improve, and ▪ to encourage the Russian Federation to join Asian regional enforcement networks and/or to ascertain difficulties in this regard. • Decision 14.69: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ support the recommendation in SC57 Doc. 31.2 to request Parties present at SC57 that breed tigers on a commercial scale to report verbally to SC57 on the progress they have made in implementation of Decision 14.69; ▪ request that the Secretariat issue a Notification to the Parties requesting that Parties with intensive operations breeding tigers on a commercial scale report to the SC by 31 December 2008 on how they are implementing this Decision, including a timeline leading to full implementation by SC58; ▪ determine at SC58 if relevant Parties have implemented this Decision; and ▪ for relevant Parties that have not implemented the Decision, decide follow-up measures to be taken to ensure implementation by no later than CoP15. • Decision 14.70: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ SSN <u>supports</u> the Secretariat's suggestion that the enforcement meeting should emphasize intelligence-led approaches. SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ not approve the Secretariat's recommendation that the meeting should be a training course; ▪ agree that the meeting should include all levels of the professional enforcement community including decision-makers, high-ranking officers, financial officers, and operational personnel; ▪ agree that the meeting should provide an opportunity for a

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		<p>declaration or statement on renewed commitment to more effective enforcement methods in future; and</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ agree that the meeting should provide an opportunity to set new benchmarks or identify indicators for measuring progress and the effectiveness of enforcement. ■ SSN recommends that, if the enforcement meeting does not provide these opportunities in the first two paragraphs above, then the CITES Enforcement Expert Group should undertake these activities. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Decision 14.71: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC include this issue (that Parties that have or seek to have specialized wildlife crime units should receive technical assistance from the Secretariat and assistance with the identification of additional opportunities for technical and financial support) in the standardized reporting format for determining compliance with Decision 14.65, as recommended above. ● Decision 14.72: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ request the Secretariat to ensure that members of the CITES Tiger Enforcement Task Force attend the upcoming meeting of the CITES Enforcement Expert Group; and ▪ request the Secretariat include this item (<i>establish a mechanism to regularly monitor and evaluate the scale and nature of illegal trade in Asian big cats</i>) on the agenda for the CITES Tiger Enforcement Task Force / CITES Enforcement Expert Group meeting.
31.2	<p>Intensive operations breeding tigers on a commercial scale</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 31.2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Prepared by India and Nepal. ● Decision 14.69 states that “<i>Parties with intensive operations breeding tigers on a commercial scale shall implement measures to restrict the captive population to a level supportive only to conserving wild tigers; tigers should not be bred for trade in their parts and derivatives.</i>” ● Requests the SC to ask all States breeding tigers on a commercial scale, to report on implementation of Decision 14.69, discuss the issue at SC58, and to make relevant recommendations to Parties and the CoP. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ support the recommendation in SC57 Doc. 31.2 to request Parties present at SC57 that breed tigers on a commercial scale to report verbally to SC57 on the progress they have made in implementation of Decision 14.69; ■ request the Secretariat issue a Notification to the Parties to request that Parties with intensive operations breeding tigers on a commercial scale to report to the SC by 31 December 2008 on how they are implementing this Decision, including a timeline leading to full implementation by SC58; ■ determine at SC58 if relevant Parties have implemented this Decision; and ■ for relevant Parties that have not implemented the Decision, decide follow up measures to be taken to ensure implementation by no later than CoP15.

ISSUE		PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
32. Tibetan antelope SC57 Doc. 32		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • RC 11.8 (Rev. CoP13) on <i>Conservation of and control of trade in the Tibetan antelope</i> directs the Standing Committee to: “undertake a regular review of the enforcement measures taken by the Parties in eliminating the illicit trade in Tibetan antelope products...” • The Secretariat states that it has received little information from the Parties on this issue. • Reports that the Interpol Wildlife Crime Working Group intends to convene a workshop on illegal trade in Tibetan antelope wool. • The Secretariat suggests that the SC consider whether the RC 11.8 (Rev. CoP13) should be amended at CoP15 to delete the requirement for a regular review by the SC. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to support the convening of a workshop on the illegal trade in Tibetan antelope wool. • SSN <u>opposes</u> the Secretariat’s suggestion to remove review requirements from RC 11.8 (Rev. CoP13). With the adoption of this text in the Resolution, the Parties have indicated that trade in Tibetan antelope is a priority issue that should be maintained on the agenda of the SC. • SSN recommends that the SC develop a mechanism to ensure the implementation of RC 11.8 (Rev. CoP13).
33. Elephants			
33.1	Reviews of the status of the elephant, trade in its specimens and the impact of the legal trade SC57 Doc. 33.1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recalls Decision 14.78 which states that the SC “<i>shall conduct ongoing comprehensive reviews of the status of the elephant, trade in its specimens and the impact of the legal trade, based on data from MIKE, the Elephant Trade Information System [ETIS] and the implementation of the Action plan for the control of trade in elephant ivory and the African elephant action Plan...</i>” • Provides an overview of current activities of the SC regarding the review of elephant status and trade, and the impact of illegal trade, under other Decisions and Resolutions (such as RC 10.10 on <i>Trade in elephant specimens</i>, ETIS, and MIKE). • The Secretariat recommends that the SC: a) agree that the implementation of Decision 14.78 should not lead to duplicative reporting and reviews; and b) request the Secretariat, in consultation with IUCN, TRAFFIC and UNEP-WCMC, to research and compile relevant information on the conservation status of and trade in both species of elephants, and provide an overview at SC58. • Also recalls Decision 14.75 which states that “...<i>The African elephant range States through the African elephant dialogue process shall develop an overall African elephant action plan for improved elephant management aiming at: a) accessing and directing resources, towards strengthening enforcement capacity in African elephant range States to combat poaching and illegal trade in ivory; b) the implementation of the Action plan for the control of trade in elephant ivory; and</i>” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Adopt all of the Secretariat’s recommendations; ■ Ensure that information from range States, NGOs and other sources is incorporated into the overview on conservation status and trade in both species of elephants to be compiled for SC 58 as well as the on-going comprehensive reviews referred to in Decision 14.78; ■ Adopt a proactive mechanism to provide regular, on-going practical assistance to range States compiling and submitting reports to the SC under Decision 14.75 for use in the implementation of Decision 14.78; ■ Adopt a fund-raising strategy that can be undertaken by the Secretariat to provide the aforementioned assistance to range States, as well as to undertake the activities in Decision 14.75; • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to consider ivory trade data available from the CITES Trade Database, some of which is presented in Annex 1, with a view to identifying problems with the use of terms and units used by Parties for trade in ivory, identifying reported trade that does not conform with the Convention, and making recommendations to the Parties at CoP15 to ensure that ivory trade conforms with the Convention and to improve the ivory trade data submitted by Parties in annual reports. • SSN is concerned, in particular with: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ The use of source codes for the export of ivory, noting that a great deal of ivory is traded under the source codes T (commercial trade purpose) and P (personal purpose);

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
	<p><i>c) enhancing capacity building, managing translocations, reducing human-elephant conflicts and enhancing community-conservation programmes and development programmes within or adjacent to the elephant range. The elephant range States will report to the Standing Committee on progress made under this decision with a view to providing the information necessary for the reviews referred to in Decision 14.78.”</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Secretariat also recommends that the SC should: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Invite range States to report on progress under Decision 14.75 with a view to providing information for the reviews referred to in Decision 14.78; ■ Invite range States and the IUCN/SSC to comment on current knowledge on populations, population status and conservation trends; ■ Request the Secretariat to report orally on the result of an analysis of all available MIKE data, which was presented to the June 2008 meeting of the African elephant range States; and ■ Request TRAFFIC to report orally on any updated ETIS data and analysis thereof that are available. ● The Annex to SC57 Doc. 33.1 contains recorded gross international trade in elephant products from 2002-2006, amounting to 37,000 trade records. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ The inconsistent use of terms (“tusk” vs “trophy” vs “teeth”); ■ The need for the use of standardized weight measurements; ■ The need for the use of weight measurements for carvings, ivory pieces, ivory scraps and other ivory that is not whole tusks, so that these can be related to the number of elephants affected by trade in these types of products. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● With regard to the Annex on trade records of elephant products, SSN <u>notes</u> that trade seems significant, with 37,000 records in five years; however, more data are needed for a thorough review, including by-country breakdowns, purpose and source codes. SSN further <u>encourages</u> the SC to establish terms of reference for the collecting and reporting of data used in the reviews, to ensure that the information collected is sufficient to fulfil the objectives of Decision 14.78 and is presented in a way that is clear, comprehensive, useful and transparent.
33.2	<p>Control of trade in elephant ivory</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 33.2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Recalls that Annotation 5 g) ii), to the Appendices, requires that ivory trade take place only to trading partners that have been verified by the Secretariat, in consultation with the SC, <i>“to have sufficient national legislation and domestic trade controls to ensure that the imported ivory will not be re-exported and will be managed in accordance with all requirements of Resolution Conf. 10. 10 (Rev. CoP14) concerning domestic manufacturing and trade”</i>. ● Provides an update of activities associated with the Action plan for the control of trade in elephant ivory. ● Notes that SC54 agreed that Japan be designated an ivory trading partner; SC55 rejected by vote, a proposal to designate China an ivory trading partner. ● States that the Secretariat is of the opinion that <i>“linking legal supplies of raw ivory from southern African countries with the legal demand in countries in Asia should help reduce the motivation for the poaching of elephants and illegal trade in</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SSN remains fundamentally <u>opposed</u> to the export of ivory stocks at a time when many thousands of elephants are still being poached and tons of ivory are traded illegally. ● Should ivory export be approved by the SC, SSN <u>recommends</u> that samples be taken from each tusk (or pair of tusks) and stored, so that ivory being legally or illegally sold can be DNA tested to see if it originates from those tusks. <p><u>Regarding the recommendation to approve China as a trading partner:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● SSN <u>urges</u> the SC not to designate China as a trading partner for the following reasons: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Such a designation fails to comply with RC 10.10 (Rev.CoP14) which requires a positive finding by the SC concerning a potential trading partner’s control over domestic manufacturing and trade. The report of the Secretariat’s 2008 mission to China as presented in this document does not provide enough detail to allow the

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
	<p><i>ivory.”</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Reports on a Secretariat mission to China in March 2008 and on auditing missions to Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe in March/April 2008, stating that no irregularities were found during the conduct of these missions. ● Recommends that the SC agree that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ as audits of their ivory stocks (total almost 108 tons) were satisfactory, Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe have met the conditions in Annotation 5. g), to allow trade in registered raw ivory from these countries; and ■ China should be designated an ivory trading partner. The Secretariat states that though China certainly remains a destination for illegal ivory, its trade controls are designed to prevent illicit ivory from being laundered through licensed premises. 	<p>Committee to conclude that the 3-day mission was adequate to address concerns raised at SC55. The Secretariat’s conclusions that implementation and enforcement are now adequate in China, and that therefore trading partner status should be approved, cannot be properly assessed on the basis of this document.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ As noted in SC57, Doc. 33.2, China remains a major destination for ivory from poached elephants. SSN believes that this fact indicates lack of control of domestic ivory trade; ■ Permitting legal import of ivory to China is likely to facilitate laundering of illegal ivory into the Chinese market, and will likely increase the poaching of elephants. We note with concern that MIKE cannot provide the fast response mechanism as originally intended since it is not sensitive enough to immediately detect and report on poaching that takes place as a result of this sale. There is also no way to “recall” the ivory once it is exported. Thus, the effect of this export on elephant poaching will not be “officially” known for years and will not be reversible. ■ Market surveys in China have detected vast amounts of illegal ivory on sale despite the existence of a registration system which appears to be widely abused and manipulated by traders (ref EIA 2007, IFAW 2006). ■ The Chinese government has legalized ivory trade by dozens of companies thought to be implicated in illicit trade (ref EIA 2007). ■ Registered traders were found to buy ivory from and sell to illegal dealers, as well as to illegally export ivory (EIA, 2007). ■ The Chinese government has auctioned off confiscated ivory from poached elephants, undermining both RC 9.10 (Rev. CoP14) on <i>Disposal of illegally traded, confiscated and accumulated specimens</i> and its own efforts to crack down on illegal trade (EIA, 2007); the Secretariat mission to address this issue examined ivory in only a few stores in one city and found no irregularities there but this does not mean that the auction did not occur. SSN remains concerned about this matter. ■ Most of China’s 20 largest cities have not been surveyed for availability of ivory and the effectiveness of government-enacted controls. ■ Not all seizures presumed destined for China are seized in China, but rather in transit. ■ A recent survey of ivory markets in the US found 24,000 ivory items on sale, with an estimated 7400 items potentially crafted after 1989. Many of these items were reportedly carved recently in and imported from China (Martin and Stiles, 2008).

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
		<p><u>Regarding ivory stockpiles in the four southern African countries:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The SC should <u>request</u> a full report on the Secretariat's audit. • Information given by the Secretariat is insufficient to determine if the conditions in Annotation 5 g) i) and v) are being complied with, i.e. that only government-owned stocks, registered by 31 January 2007 and originating in the State (excluding seized ivory and ivory of unknown origin) may be traded • The Secretariat provides no information on its audit; it just records the quantities of ivory declared for sale. The SC should request a full report on these figures. It is notable that the quantities now declared for sale, and verified by the Secretariat differ greatly from the amounts discussed for sale at CoP14 and from those amounts declared in earlier proposals: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ for <u>Botswana</u> (43,682.91 kg), the declared quantity is 2,062.71 kg less than the amount given in CoP14 Prop. 5; and ■ for <u>Zimbabwe</u> (3,755.55 kg), the stockpile appears surprisingly small for a population claimed last year to number over 100,000 elephants, and given that as of 31 Dec 2001 government stocks amounted to 13,559.81 kg (excluding ivory classified as confiscated or poached) (CoP12 Prop. 10).
<p>33.3</p>	<p>African elephant action plan and African Elephant Fund</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 33.3</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision 14.75 directs the African elephant range States to develop an African elephant Action Plan for improved elephant management. The Secretariat requested the IUCN/SSC African Elephant Specialist Group to compile a draft Action Plan in a transparent manner, in close consultation with the African elephant range States, and provide opportunities for comment and input at all stages. • Decision 14.79 directs the Secretariat to establish an African Elephant Fund that will be applied to the implementation of the African elephant Action Plan. The Secretariat is undertaking a study to explore possible sources of funding for the creation of the Fund. • Both the Action Plan and Fund are to be discussed at the African elephant meeting, 23-25 June 2008 in Mombasa, Kenya. • The Secretariat recommends that the SC take note of this document and invite African elephant range States to report on progress made under Decision 14.75. <p><u>Regarding Decision 14.75:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>notes</u> that Decision 14.75 makes it clear that the African elephant Action Plan should be developed and driven by the range States. • SSN <u>supports</u> the Secretariat's intention to ensure that the process is inclusive of all stakeholders, and suggests that, to ensure this is the case in future, designated representatives of African Elephant range States are included in all correspondence with regard to developing an Action Plan • SSN <u>believes</u> the Action Plan must be a consensus document of all the stakeholders (all the elephant range States and potential donors) in order to attract the necessary funds for the African Elephant Fund. <p><u>Regarding Decision 14.79:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>believes</u> that law enforcement, including enhancing cross-border enforcement mechanisms such as the Lusaka Agreement, should be a funding priority within the African Elephant Fund.

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
<p>33.4</p> <p>Decision-making mechanism for authorizing ivory trade</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 33.4</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decision 14.77 directs the SC, assisted by the Secretariat, to propose for approval at the latest at CoP16, a decision-making mechanism for a process of trade in ivory under the auspices of the CoP. • The Secretariat proposes that the SC agree that a study be undertaken on the development of this decision-making mechanism for review at SC58, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ examination of the various processes and decision-making mechanisms related to ivory trade that are or have been operating under the provisions of the Convention; ■ evaluation of multilateral trade regimes and associated controls, safeguards and monitoring methods for other high-value commodities, with the aim of identifying a mechanism that might apply to future trade in ivory; ■ basic principles that should govern future trade in ivory, and proposals on how an effective, objective and independent decision-making mechanism could operate; and ■ exploration of the conditions under which international trade in elephant ivory could take place. • In undertaking this study, the Secretariat states that it would consult “<i>organizations with specific expertise in the area of the establishment of multilateral trade regimes and the implementation of related trade controls.</i>” 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>believes</u> it is too early to be considering development of the decision-making mechanism. Any effects of the stockpile sales approved at SC55 and CoP14 must first be documented and understood. • SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC constitute, at a future SC meeting once the one-off sales have taken place, a Working Group to determine terms of reference for such a study and by whom it should be conducted. • SSN <u>recommends</u> that the SC ensure that such a Working Group is open to participation from all interested bodies including NGOs, experts and stakeholders in order to ensure that the process is both open and transparent. • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to amend the Secretariat’s proposed study to ensure that evaluation of trade regimes and controls for other high-valued commodities examine only those commodities that are similar in nature to elephants. There is no point to comparing dissimilar commodities. As a commodity, elephants are mostly unprotected from poachers (there is unrestricted access to the resource) and they are a limited resource with a very limited capacity to replenish. The continued existence of elephants is also threatened by many factors other than trade. SSN believes there are very few, if any, high-value commodities that can compare to elephants. • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to instruct the Secretariat to consult widely with any and all sources with information relevant to the study, including NGOs, scientists and others.
<p>33.5</p> <p>Constitution of a MIKE-ETIS subgroup</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 33.5</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • RC 10.10 (Rev. CoP14) on <i>Trade in elephant specimens</i> agrees that the Monitoring the Illegal Killing of Elephants (MIKE) and the Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS), established under the supervision of the Standing Committee, shall continue and be expanded • Recommends that the SC re-constitute the MIKE-ETIS Subgroup of six SC Members, consider the development and implementation of MIKE and ETIS, and report back at the present meeting. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>supports</u> the re-establishment of a MIKE-ETIS Subgroup and encourages the SC to ensure a balanced representation of range states. • SSN <u>notes</u> that it was stressed at CoP14 that range states should “own” the baseline data and be included in their compilation, and that both the MIKE and ETIS Subgroup and the TAG are to be consulted before the publication of data, • SSN continues to be concerned that the data gathered by MIKE, despite significant levels of investment, are not portraying a true picture of the levels of illegal killing of elephants. The selection of sites is strongly biased towards protected areas; data are not up-to-date, have been collected in different years and with different methods and therefore are not really comparable. MIKE is therefore not able to detect increases in poaching in time.

ISSUE		PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
34. Rhinoceroses SC57 Doc. 34		The Secretariat: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • States that it is convinced that there is a highly-organized nature to much of the poaching and illicit trade in rhinoceros currently taking place. • Recommends, if poaching and illegal trade continue, convening an enforcement seminar or workshop for range and consumer States or, alternatively, convening a CITES Rhinoceros Enforcement Task Force. • Seeks to contact Yemen for an invitation to conduct a mission there to discuss illicit trade in rhinoceros. • States that the U.S.A. has produced a report on ballistic examinations and evidence, to assist in obtaining evidence for convictions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to support the recommendations in this document.
35. Sturgeons			
35.1	Caviar trade database SC57 Doc. 35.1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • RC 12.7 (Rev. CoP14) on <i>Conservation of and trade in sturgeons and paddlefish</i> recommends that the Secretariat report at each SC meeting on the operation of the caviar trade database. • The database was launched on 30 November 2007. • The Secretariat requests SC regional representatives to encourage caviar-trading States in their regions increase the regularity of their submissions to the database; of particular concern are Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation. The Islamic Republic of Iran, the U.S.A., and Turkey do not submit data regularly or have not submitted any data. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to request responses from Kazakhstan, the Russian Federation, the Islamic Republic of Iran, the U.S.A., and Turkey on concerns about their reporting.
35.2	Recommendations of the Animals Committee SC57 Doc. 35.2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prepared by the Chairman of the AC. • RC 12.7 (Rev. CoP14) on <i>Conservation of and trade in sturgeons and paddlefish</i>, directs the AC to carry out an evaluation of the assessment and the monitoring methodologies used for stocks of Acipenseriformes species. • The AC urges the CITES Secretariat to promote the holding of a workshop to review existing sturgeon stock assessment / Total Allowable Catch determination methodology and elaborate a scientific methodology that is internationally acceptable. • Invites the SC to note the report. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>supports</u> the recommendations of the AC.
36. Bigleaf mahogany SC57 Doc. 36		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SC55 adopted recommendations regarding the implementation of CITES for bigleaf mahogany (<i>Swietenia macrophylla</i>) in Peru, including, <i>inter alia</i>, that: 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to support the Secretariat's recommendation to freeze all exports of mahogany under its 2008 quota until Peru has ratified and implemented the Strategic Action Plan for Mahogany,

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ starting in 2008, Peru should not establish export quotas based on leftovers from harvesting and exports of previous years; and ■ Peru should ratify at the highest political level the Strategic Action Plan for Mahogany (PAEC). • Notes that PC17 included bigleaf mahogany in the Review of Significant Trade. • The Secretariat suggests that the SC maintain the existing recommendations until all of them are completed and, in addition, recommend that: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Peru should freeze further exports under the 2008 quota for bigleaf mahogany until the PAEC has been adopted at the highest political level; ■ Peru should follow the recommendations of the commission (an established multi-sectoral commission against illegal logging) on timber yield coefficients in establishing the 2009 export quota; and ■ Peru should clarify whether it has any leftovers from years prior to 2007 and explain how it differentiates them (as well as the 2007 leftovers) from timber harvested in 2008. Peru should consider exhausting all of these leftovers by 31 December 2008. • The Secretariat requests the endorsement of the SC to continue supervising the progress made by Peru in implementing the SC recommendations regarding mahogany and to report to SC58. 	<p>with support from the highest political levels. SSN urges that this freeze be maintained until Peru has also:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ established and implemented an effective system to verify the legal origin of all specimens <i>in situ</i> prior to harvest and export; and ■ adopted an appropriate timber yield coefficient, necessary for making non-detriment findings. <p>These actions should be completed before establishing a 2009 quota.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to recommend that Peru: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ eliminate exports of mahogany “leftovers” from quotas prior to 2008 since (a) legal origin cannot be determined for wood from quotas prior to 2007, and (b) an inflated timber yield coefficient was used to calculate these volumetric quotas; ■ commits to permanently discontinue the export of any “leftover” mahogany with immediate effect; ■ limit exports in 2009 to <u>trees</u> that have been verified and approved in the field, and in accordance with the Scientific Authority’s findings on non-detrimental harvest, using the appropriate timber yield coefficient to establish a volumetric quota; and ■ verify through ocular field inspections the legal origin of all <i>Cedrela odorata</i> exports, given the evidence that some exports in prior years did not meet the Appendix III legal finding requirement. • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ direct the Secretariat to continue to monitor Peru’s progress and report back at future meetings; and ■ direct the PC to incorporate the information contained in this report and the recommendations of the SC into any recommendations made for this species under the Review of Significant Trade.
<p>37. Ramin SC57 Doc. 37 (Rev. 1)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In response to concerns regarding illegal trade in ramin (<i>Gonystylus</i> spp.), the issue was included on the agendas of SC50-SC54. • SC54 requested that China, Italy, Japan, Malaysia, the United Kingdom and the United States provide written reports on ramin for SC57. Reports were received from China, Italy, Japan, Malaysia and the United States (Annexes 1 to 5); Malaysia also submitted a more comprehensive report (SC57 Inf. 4). • Recommends that, on the basis of these written reports, the SC decide whether any further action is necessary and 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>welcomes</u> the detailed report of Malaysia. However, SSN is <u>concerned</u> that the export quota for Peninsular Malaysia (20,000 m³ in 2007) remains very high. Due to concerns regarding the sustainability of this quota and recent evidence of ongoing illegal trade between Indonesia and Malaysia, the EU in 2007 temporarily suspended ramin imports from Malaysia. Although the EU has subsequently accepted the quota, Malaysia should present validated scientific information within its non-detriment finding for the setting of future quotas. • SSN <u>notes</u> that the 70% conversion factor currently used by Malaysia as the assumed usable sawn timber yield from each standing tree is quite high in comparison with published studies of

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
	<p>whether this item still needs to be included in the agenda at future SC meetings.</p>	<p>other timber species. The conversion factor plays an important role in determining the actual impact of an export quota on the forest, and SSN <u>urges</u> Malaysia to demonstrate the technical studies which validate use of this figure.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to carefully review information on the methods that Malaysia uses to assure legal origin and compliance with national forestry laws. • SSN <u>urges</u> Indonesia, Malaysia and Singapore to continue efforts to combat illegal trade in ramin through the Tri-National Task Force and other measures. • SSN <u>urges</u> the SC to maintain this issue on the agenda for future meetings.
<p>38. Periodic Review of the Appendices</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 38</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prepared by the Chairs of the AC and PC. • RC 14.8, on <i>Periodic Review of the Appendices</i>, states that the AC and PC shall establish a schedule for the Periodic Review of the Appendices and identify a list of taxa they propose to review during the next two intersessional periods between the CoPs. • Provides the recommendations adopted by AC23 and PC17 regarding the Periodic Review. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN <u>encourages</u> the SC to note the document.
<p>39. Revision and publication of the CITES Appendices</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 39</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prepared by Japan. • Japan recommends that the SC explore a way to smooth and accelerate the revision of the Appendices after meetings of the CoP, especially when new standard nomenclature references are adopted. • Recommends that the SC request the Secretariat to report to SC58, after consultation with the AC and PC, on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ information which should be included in proposals to amend the standard nomenclature for species included in the Appendices; and ■ obstacles to accelerate the publication of revised Appendices and options for the future. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SSN notes that Article XV, paragraph 1 (c), of the Convention regarding “Amendments to Appendices I and II” stipulates that: <i>Amendments adopted at a meeting shall enter into force 90 days after that meeting for all Parties except those which make a reservation in accordance with paragraph 3 of this Article.</i> • As noted by Japan in this document, the revised Appendices, including amendments to the standard nomenclature, were published 77 days after CoP14, which is well within the 90 day time frame. • SSN does not agree that there is a need to accelerate or smooth this process.
<p>40. Reports of regional representatives</p> <p>SC57 Doc. 40.1 – 40.6</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • By 25 June 2008, reports submitted by Asia, North America, and Oceania. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No comment.
<p>41. Any other business</p> <p>No document</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No document. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No comment.

ISSUE	PROPOSED ACTIONS	SSN RECOMMENDATIONS
42. Determination of the time and venue of the 58th meeting No document	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No document. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No comment.
43. Closing remarks No document	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No document. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No comment.



SPECIES SURVIVAL NETWORK

2100 L Street NW, Washington DC 20037 USA

Tel: +1-301-548-7769 Fax: +1-202-318-0891

info@ssn.org • www.ssn.org